

Town of Whitby

Staff Report

whitby.ca/CouncilCalendar



Report Title: Removal of 301 Colborne St. E. from the Municipal Heritage Register

Report to: Committee of the Whole

Date of meeting: April 3, 2023

Report Number: PDP 17-23

Department(s) Responsible:

Planning and Development Department
(Planning Services)

Submitted by:

Roger Saunders, Commissioner of
Planning and Development

| |
|---|
| Acknowledged by M. Gaskell, Chief Administrative Officer |
|---|

For additional information, contact:

Dave Johnson, Planner II – Heritage, ext.
3166

1. Recommendation:

1. That the property municipally known as 301 Colborne Street East be removed from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register; and,
2. That a full Heritage Documentation Report be prepared prior to demolition and submitted to the Planning and Development Department, to be deposited at the Whitby Archives.

2. Highlights:

- GHD on behalf of Vandenoorn Properties has submitted an Application for Removal of a Non-designated Property from the Municipal Heritage Register in order to develop the site for residential uses.
- A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) submitted along with the application has determined that the property does not exhibit cultural heritage value.
- The Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee has reviewed the application and do not object to the subject property being removed from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register.
- A Heritage Documentation Report is required to be submitted before demolition takes place for deposit into the Whitby Archives.

3. Background:

The subject property is located at the southeast corner of Colborne Street East and Athol Street and is municipally known as 301 Colborne St. E (refer to Attachment #1). The site is approximately 0.10 ha (0.24 acres) in size and is listed on the Town's Municipal Heritage Register. There is currently one structure on the property.

Overview of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA)

The applicant submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), prepared by Letourneau Heritage Consulting (LHC), dated April 2022 (refer to Attachment #2).

According to the CHIA, the main structure was constructed in 1876 as a late Victorian vernacular residence with influences of the Gothic Revival Style. The structure is a two-storey residential building. The building is vinyl-clad with a medium-pitch, front-facing gable roof and vinyl soffits. The gable roof is interrupted twice with a lancet window and a two-storey bay window. There is a front facing porch of vinyl construction with some wooden features of decorative bargeboard. The CHIA notes that the two-bay window and off-centred entrance and front gable peak are not characteristic of Gothic Revival cottage design.

The CHIA includes interior and exterior descriptions, background research and analysis, an overview of the historical context and a property morphology of ownership over time since before construction until the 1980s.

4. Discussion:

GHD on behalf of Vandenboom properties is requesting the removal of the subject lands from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register, in order to develop the site for residential uses. In order to demolish the existing structure on the lands, the applicant is required to de-list the property. As part of the de-listing process, the applicant is required to determine its historical significance through a CHIA.

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Evaluation

The lands have been assessed in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06, which provides criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest related to design or physical value, historical or associative value, and contextual value, as follows:

- The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - is a rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method;
 - displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit; or
 - demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- The property has historical or associative value because it:

- has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community;
 - yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture; or
 - demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community.
- The property has contextual value because it:
 - is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area;
 - is physical, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings; or
 - is a landmark.

Through a review of the information and images of the structure, the applicant's heritage consultant, LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc. (LHC) determined that the property met 0 of 9 criteria for cultural heritage value or interest, as summarized in Table 2 of Attachment #2.

It is LHC's opinion that based upon background research, analysis and LHC's understanding of current conditions the property located at 301 Colborne Street:

- does not have design or physical value as a rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method. Nor does it demonstrate a high degree of craftsmanship, artistic merit, or technological or scientific achievement;
- does not have historical or associative value; and,
- does not have contextual value.

As a result, it is LHC's opinion that the subject lands do not exhibit cultural heritage value or interest as the lands do not meet any of the criteria of Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Consultation with Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee

The applicant and their heritage consultant attended the February 14th, 2023 meeting of the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee (HWAC).

At the meeting, the applicant and consultant presented the CHIA to HWAC.

The Committee passed the following motion:

"That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee supports the Application to Remove a Property (301 Colborne Street East) from the Municipal Heritage Register."

Refer to Attachment #3 for minutes of the February 14th, 2023 HWAC meeting.

Conclusion

Based on a review of the application, photographs, and the CHIA submitted in support of the request to de-list the property located at 301 Colborne St. East, the subject lands have been significantly altered architecturally. Architecturally, the lands no longer exhibit Gothic Revival influences as many unsympathetic alterations have taken place.

Accordingly, it is recommended that Council remove the subject lands from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register.

It is further recommended that a Heritage Documentation Report be submitted before demolition takes place for deposit into the Whitby Archives. The Heritage Documentation report must contain the following:

- a statement of cultural heritage value;
- overview of scope and methods used to document the lands;
- as-built floor plan drawings;
- photo documentation of the property;
- elevation photo documentation;
- drawings of the exterior of the house; and,
- interior views of all rooms and features.

5. Financial Considerations:

Not applicable

6. Communication and Public Engagement:

The Town of Whitby Heritage Register will be updated accordingly. The Register is available for public review. A copy of this staff report is available on the Town's website.

7. Input from Departments/Sources:

Not applicable.

8. Strategic Priorities:

The recommendations contained in this report align with the objectives of the Corporate Strategic Plan.

This report is in a fully accessible format, which addresses the Town's strategic priority of accessibility.

9. Attachments:

Attachment #1 – Location Sketch – 301 Colborne Street East

Attachment #2 – Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared by Letourneau Heritage Consultants (LHC)

Attachment #3 – Minutes of February 14, 2023 HWAC meeting