

Town of Whitby

Staff Report

whitby.ca/CouncilCalendar



Report Title: Removal of 305 Mary St. E. from the Municipal Heritage Register

Report to: Committee of the Whole

Date of meeting: May 1, 2023

Report Number: PDP 25-23

Department(s) Responsible:

Planning and Development Department
(Planning Services)

Submitted by:

Roger Saunders, Commissioner of
Planning and Development

**Acknowledged by M. Gaskell, Chief
Administrative Officer**

For additional information, contact:

Dave Johnson, Planner II – Heritage, ext.
3166

1. Recommendation:

1. That the property municipally known as 305 Mary Street East be removed from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register; and,
2. That a full Heritage Documentation Report be prepared by the applicant at their expense prior to demolition and submitted to the Planning and Development Department, to be deposited at the Archives.

2. Highlights:

- MacNaughton Hermsen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited (MHBC), on behalf of the property owner, has submitted an Application for Removal of a Non-designated Property from the Municipal Heritage Register in order to redevelop the site for residential uses.
- A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) has determined that the property does not exhibit cultural heritage value.
- The Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee has reviewed the application and does not object to the subject property being removed from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register.
- A Heritage Documentation Report is required to be prepared and submitted by the applicant, at their expense before demolition takes place, for deposit into the Archives.

3. Background:

The subject property is located on the south side of Mary St. E, east of Brock St. N, west Garden Street and is municipally known as 305 Mary St. E (refer to Attachment #1). The site is approximately 0.21 ha (0.51 acres) in size and is listed on the Town's Municipal Heritage Register. There is currently one structure on the property.

Overview of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA)

The applicant has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), prepared by MacNaughton Hermsen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited (MHBC), dated February 2023 (refer to Attachment #2).

According to the CHIA, the main structure was constructed sometime between 1870 and 1875 as a worker's house and is not particularly representative of any architectural style. The structure is a two-storey frame residential building. The building was later altered with the addition of a bay window, and exterior cladding. The building features that have been altered include the chimney and foundation. The CHIA notes that the building does retain some original elements, including dormer detailing, wood sills and window openings, but concludes that these elements are not unique or exceptional.

The CHIA includes interior and exterior descriptions, background research and analysis, and an overview of the historical context.

4. Discussion:

MacNaughton Hermsen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited (MHBC), on behalf of the property owner, is requesting the removal of the subject lands from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register, in order to develop the site for residential uses. In order to demolish the existing structure on the lands, the applicant is required to de-list the property. As part of the de-listing process, the applicant is required to determine its historical significance through a CHIA.

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Evaluation

The lands have been assessed in accordance with the requirements of the Ontario Heritage Act under Ontario Regulation 9/06, which provides the following criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest related to design or physical value, historical or associative value, and contextual value:

- The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - is a rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method;
 - displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit; or
 - demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

- The property has historical or associative value because it:
 - has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community;
 - yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture; or
 - demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community.
- The property has contextual value because it:
 - is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area;
 - is physical, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings; or
 - is a landmark.

Through a review of the information and images of the structure, MHBC has determined that the property met 0 of 9 criteria for cultural heritage value or interest, as summarized in Section 6.1 of Attachment #2.

Based upon background research, analysis and MHBC's understanding of current conditions of the property located at 305 Mary St. E, the CHIA concludes that the property:

- does not have design or physical value as a rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method, nor does it demonstrate a high degree of craftsmanship, artistic merit, or technological or scientific achievement;
- does not have historical or associative value; and,
- does not have contextual value.

As a result, it is MHBC's opinion that the subject lands do not exhibit cultural heritage value or interest as the lands do not meet any of the criteria of Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Consultation with Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee

The applicant and their heritage consultant attended the March 14th, 2023 meeting of the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee (HWAC). Refer to Attachment #3 for minutes of the March 14, 2023 HWAC meeting.

At the meeting, the applicant and consultant presented the CHIA to HWAC.

The Committee adopted the following motion:

"That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee supports the removal of 305 Mary Street East from the Municipal Heritage Register."

Conclusion

Based on a review of the application, photographs, and the CHIA submitted in support of the request to de-list the property located at 305 Mary St. East, the subject lands have been significantly altered and does not represent any particular architectural style.

Accordingly, it is recommended that Council remove the subject lands from the Town's Municipal Heritage Register.

It is further recommended that a Heritage Documentation Report be prepared and submitted by the applicant at their expense before demolition takes place for deposit into the Archives. The Heritage Documentation report must contain the following:

- a statement of cultural heritage value;
- overview of scope and methods used to document the lands;
- as-built floor plan drawings;
- photo documentation of the property;
- elevation photo documentation;
- drawings of the exterior of the house; and,
- interior views of all rooms and features.

5. Financial Considerations:

Not Applicable.

6. Communication and Public Engagement:

The Town of Whitby Heritage Register would be updated accordingly should Council approve the request to remove the property from the Municipal Heritage Register. The Register is available for public review. A copy of this staff report is available on the Town's website.

7. Input from Departments/Sources:

Not applicable.

8. Strategic Priorities:

The recommendations contained in this report align with the objectives of the Corporate Strategic Plan.

This report is in a fully accessible format, which addresses the Town's strategic priority of accessibility.

9. Attachments:

Attachment #1 – Location Sketch – 305 Mary St. E

Attachment #2 – Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared by ,
MacNaughton Hermsen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited
(MHBC)

Attachment #3 – Minutes of March 14, 2023 HWAC meeting