

Attachment 1 – Detailed Summary of Animal Sheltering Options

Option 1A - New Dedicated Animal Shelter

COST	\$4,800,000 (approximately)
Location	Town-owned Parcel at the south-west corner of Broadleaf Avenue and McKinney Drive (no address assigned), south of the McKinney Recreation Centre and west of the Whitby Operations Centre
Proposal	New, state-of-the-art, net-zero One-Storey dedicated Animal Services Shelter of approximately 900 square metres (9700 square feet approximately). Design allows for future second-storey expansion.
Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An expanded, state-of-the-art, net-zero facility geared towards improved animal care • Town maintains control over a service to the public in a centralized location within the Town, including service levels and costs • No longer dependent on contributions from other municipalities to support operations • Location at Whitby Municipal Operations Campus familiar to the public, which is optimally located to improve service coordination and delivery • Increased space to facilitate delivery of services and education programs • Design allows for a second storey expansion to allow for co-location of other municipal divisions • Costs offset by sale of existing WASC land and savings from capital expenditures for existing WASC
Challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mitigation necessary through design to reduce/eliminate noise impacts to adjacent school and residents • Visual and physical mitigation required to protect animals from the public • Requires additional capital expenditure/debt issuance for the Town • Future construction of second floor would be disruptive to both animals and staff.

Option 1B - New Enforcement Services Facility

COST	\$9,600,000 (approximately)
Location	Town-owned Parcel at the south-west corner of Broadleaf Avenue and McKinney Drive (no address assigned), south of the McKinney Recreation Centre and west of the Whitby Operations Centre
Proposal	New, state-of-the-art, net-zero two-storey Animal Services Shelter (first floor) and second floor office space (for Enforcement Services, or another Town Division) of approximately 1750 square metres (18,800 square feet approx.).
Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An expanded, state-of-the-art, net-zero facility geared towards improved animal care, with additional office space for By-law and Parking Services to accommodate growth in the Division. • Allows for the whole Division to be “under one roof” to coordinate operations, service response and delivery • Town maintains control over animal services to the public and creates centralized location for residents to address animal, by-law and parking concerns. For Animal Services, this includes control over service levels and costs related to sheltering. • No longer dependent on contributions from other municipalities to support animal services operations • Location at Whitby Municipal Operations Campus familiar to the public, which is optimally located to improve service coordination and delivery • Increased space to facilitate delivery of services and education programs • Reduce or eliminate need for leased space at Garden Street office • Costs offset by sale of existing WASC land and reallocation from capital expenditures for existing WASC
Challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Costliest Option • Mitigation necessary through design to reduce/eliminate noise impacts to adjacent school and residents • Visual and physical mitigation required to protect animals from the public • Requires additional capital expenditure/debt issuance for the Town



Option 2 – Partnership with HSDR & OSPCA

COST	<p>Two-year Contract: Year 1 = \$180,000; Year 2 - \$180,000 + CPI. Total cost to 2031 (assuming base rate and 2.5% rate of inflation) = \$1,792,000 1.0 FTE Staff Reduction for Shelter Support</p>
Location	1505 Wentworth St, Whitby, ON (off of Thickson Road, south of Victoria Street)
Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Well-known, state-of-the-art facility operated in partnership with the OSPCA with on-site veterinary services • Town no longer responsible for costs, risk and expenses of sheltering animals • Centralized adoption services for residents of Town and Region • No new capital expenditures for animal sheltering services
Challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase of City’s Operating Budget • Intake numbers are capped at 375 animals/year, with additional cost of \$475/animal • Estimated cost over long term not a significant economic savings vs. existing WASC facility • Layoff of 1.0 FTE required • Town would lose control over service levels, adoption and destruction policy of animals • Not geared towards long term care of animals (i.e. Court-mandated holds) and additional boarding fees may be required (up to \$100/day). • Negative effect on Staff morale • Separate agreement required for disposal of deadstock

Option 3 – Partnership with Neighbouring Municipalities

Please see the Confidential Memorandum Accompanying this Report

Option 4 - Maintain and Update Existing WASC

COST	<p>\$691,300 currently budgeted for upgrades (deferred) \$797,500 (2021 \$) forecasted for facility upgrades to 2031 Estimated Capital Cost to 2031: \$1,488,800</p>
Location	4680 Thickson Road
Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Location is well known to the Community • Facility is located away from residential uses, and Town has received few complaints about noise/nuisance • Lowest Cost Option to maintain services within the Town
Challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feasibility is unclear as facilities are dated, and may not reflect the latest in animal welfare (but meets all current Provincial Requirements). • Lands located near a CLOCA regulated area, which may make expansion of the facility difficult if future upgrades are required • Unrealized value from existing land holding