

Attachment #3

Excerpt of Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment and Statement of Significance

6.1 HERITAGE EVALUATION OF SUBJECT PROPERTY

Based on the provincial Heritage Criteria in sub-section 4.1, the grading of the subject house is assessed in Table 3 below.

Table 3: Evaluation of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest Summary Table

Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	Assessment (Yes/No)	Rationale
1. Design or physical value:		
a) Is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method	Yes	The subject property is associated with a specific architectural style that is unique to its time or surroundings. The property was built using the Georgian architectural style and constructed entirely of Kingston limestone. The limestone remains in its original condition and is one of the only limestone houses in the area apart from the 1849 Henry House Museum in Oshawa harbor. Mayfield is a unique structure within the built context of Whitby. The construction method used is usually associated with Scottish settlers such as the Thomson family.
b) Displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	Yes	The decorative elements used for the subject property display a high degree of craftsmanship. There are considerable amounts of artistic and detailed elements seen in the exterior and interior components of the dwelling that exhibit high degrees of craftsmanship. The high quality of workmanship is seen in the finishing details of the house along with its vernacular character.

c) Demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement	No	The existing materials and assembly found on the structure, including its subsequent alterations and additions, do not reflect an innovative form of technical or scientific achievement.
2. Historical or associative value:		
a) Has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community	Yes	The historical associations of the property are directly linked to John Thomson and his family and more recently, Jim Flaherty and Christine Elliott and their family. John Thomson and his family are some of the earliest immigrants from Scotland to Durham County, and are an important part of the cultural heritage of Whitby. Mayfield House was specifically built for John Thomson and its style is a demonstration of Scottish settler traditions. Christine Elliott and the late Jim Flaherty, as important political leaders, have been instrumental with the development of various institutions of Whitby.
b) Yields, or has potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	Yes	The subject property does have a direct contribution to the culture of the surrounding community. Previously the lands around Mayfield were used for agricultural and farming purposes, although they are mainly suburban residential areas now. The contextual landscape surrounding the property has significantly changed since the house was constructed. Nevertheless, the preserved heritage house provides a built commemoration of Whitby's history which contributes to an understanding of the community's past.
c) Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community	No	No architect, artist, builder, or theorist is associated with the subject property. The name of the builder of Mayfield is unknown. It was noted that the house took a considerably long time to build. Evidence of the prolonged construction period is the varying pattern of baseboards and shutters in different

		rooms within the house. Since the builder was not able to complete the house within the allotted time his wage was reduced and was only paid a deposit of 90 pounds.
3. Contextual value:		
a) Is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area	No	The context of the heritage house is no longer the farmland character which defined this intersection. The visual and physical relationship between the property and the surrounding streetscape has changed over time, as discussed above.
b) Is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings	Yes	The subject property is historically linked to its surroundings through the period of its construction and location in the Town of Whitby. The use of Kingston limestone was a unique construction material for residential homes within Whitby at that specific period and thus holds historical value as an early construction material farmhouse in this location.
c) Is a landmark	Yes	The heritage house's prominent visibility along Garden Street and Manning Road allows the property to maintain distinctive vistas from the streets within the residential area. Being one of the finest built dwellings of the early stages in Whitby, its unique limestone construction makes Mayfield a local landmark which is visible from both adjacent major streets.

The subject property meets 2/3rds of the design criteria, 2/3rds of the historical criteria and 2/3rd of the contextual criteria. Based on this assessment, a statement of cultural heritage value has been prepared.

6.2 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE

6.2.1 Description of Historic Place

The Mayfield House is located near the corner of Manning Road and Garden Street in the Town of Whitby. A two-storey stone building with an attic was constructed in 1845 for the Thomson family, and its style is a demonstration of Scottish settler traditions. A recent addition was constructed to the north side, influenced by Regency architecture. The first floor is used as residential living space, while the second floor houses the bedrooms. The addition is currently being used for office space. A separate garage and a large yard also exist on the property.

Mayfield has a form which is typical of the Georgian Style, and the whole residential dwelling was constructed using Kingston limestone. The front façade is divided into three bays consisting of a central doorway and windows on either side. The limestone was supplied by a grain merchant named John Welsh in the 1840s, and it is likely that the stones were cut in Kingston by the Penitentiary prisoners. The east and west sides of the building are the gable ends. The back of the house is noteworthy for the presence of the large stair hall window, which consists of twelve-pane over an eight-pan sashes.

The interior of the Mayfield House demonstrates the high quality of woodwork and the careful rehabilitation which has been undertaken. There are considerable amounts of artistic and detailed elements in the interior components of the dwelling that exhibit high degrees of craftsmanship.

6.2.2 Heritage Value

The cultural heritage value of the Mayfield House is related to its design or physical values, historical or associative values and contextual values.

The property has a design or physical value because it is rare, unique and representative of the Georgian architectural style in the Whitby community. It was constructed entirely of Kingston limestone with a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit in detailed elements seen in the exterior and interior components of the dwelling.

The property has historical or associative value as it reflects the construction method, which is associated with an early Scottish settler in the Town of Whitby. Thomson and his family are some of the earliest immigrants from Scotland to Durham County and are an important part of the cultural heritage of Whitby. Mayfield House was the house also has an important recent association with Christine Elliott and Jim Flaherty as important political leaders in this community specifically built for John Thomson, and its style is a demonstration of Scottish settler traditions.

The Mayfield House has contextual value because it contributes to the character and identity of the Town of Whitby. Being one of the finest built dwellings of the early stages in Whitby, its unique limestone construction makes Mayfield a local landmark, which is visible from both adjacent major streets.

6.2.3 Heritage Attributes

Attributes related to its style as a Georgian farmhouse in the original structure constructed in 1845:

- Rectangular plan
- Simple massing with side gable roof and paired stone chimneys
- Symmetrical composition of the 3-bay principal elevation (south elevation)
- Wooden fascia, soffit, projected eaves & eave returns, and related mouldings
- Use of rectangular window and door openings throughout
- Wooden 8-over 8 sashes, double hung windows and flat stone arch lintels above
- The attic quarter fanlight wood windows and stone arch lintels above
- The 12 over-8 sashes wood window at stair hall
- Principal entrance comprises enclosed panel recessed, exterior panel door with transoms, exterior woodwork including modified Doric pilasters with a dentilated entablature
- Centre-hallway with the large moulded archway in the middle and two principal rooms on each side.
- Original interior window shutters at principal rooms (dining room and parlour)
- Attributes related to its craftsmanship / artistic merit:
- Its Kingston limestone masonry, including:
 - Rock-faced stone surface
 - Finely laid coursed ashlar with tight joints
 - Window/ door flat and arched stone lintels with the voussoirs and keystones
- The Curly Maple balustrades comprised of newel post, slender balusters and handrail at interior dog-legged stairs
- Interior finish carpentry, including:
 - Window casings and the wainscoting below
 - Door casings
 - Panelling

