



Special Council Minutes

November 28, 2024, 7:00 p.m.
Council Chambers
Whitby Town Hall

Present: Mayor Roy
Councillor Bozinovski (Virtual Attendance)
Councillor Cardwell
Councillor Leahy
Councillor Lee
Councillor Lundquist (Virtual Attendance)
Councillor Mulcahy
Councillor Shahid
Councillor Yamada

Also Present: S. Klein, Deputy Chief Administrative Officer
M. Hickey, Fire Chief
J. Long, Head of Organizational Effectiveness
J. Romano, Commissioner of Community Services
F. Santaguida, Commissioner of Legal and Enforcement
Services/Town Solicitor
R. Saunders, Commissioner of Planning and Development
F. Wong, Commissioner of Financial Services/Treasurer
M. Dodge, Executive Advisor to the Mayor
C. Harris, Town Clerk
K. Douglas, Sr. Legislative Specialist (Recording Secretary)

-
1. Call To Order: The Mayor
 2. Call of the Roll: The Clerk
 3. Declarations of Conflict of Interest

There were no declarations of conflict of interest.

4. Delegations
 - 4.1 Steven Godwin and Mike Wingrove, Residents (In-Person Attendance)

Re: Council Amendments to the 2025 to 2027 Strong Mayor's Budget

Steven Godwin and Mike Wingrove, Residents, expressed their concerns regarding the proposed 2025 to 2027 Budget and the potential property tax implications of the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation's (MPAC) next province wide reassessment. They noted the impact of increased property taxes on affordability for residents. Mr. Wingrove provided a spreadsheet outlining the increase to his property taxes between 2018 to 2024 and projected future increases.

A question and answer period ensued between Members of Council, Staff, Steven Godwin and Mike Wingrove regarding:

- clarification regarding the calculation of Mr. Wingrove's cumulative property taxes;
- concerns regarding the potential property tax implications of MPAC's next province wide reassessment;
- whether MPAC has recently reassessed the delegate's property;
- whether the delegates are seeking alignment between budget increases and the rate of inflation;
- continued consultation between Town staff and residents regarding property taxes and the budget; and,
- the difficulty of comparing the proposed or approved budgets of neighbouring municipalities given the variety of factors impacting budget calculations.

F. Wong, Commission of Financial Services/Treasurer explained the calculation of property taxes using MPAC's assessed value and the property tax rate, as well as the potential impact of the next province wide reassessment. Mr. Wong advised that Town staff are available to meet with residents to clarify the calculation of their property taxes.

5. Items for Consideration

F. Wong, Commissioner of Financial Services/Treasurer provided a presentation regarding the Town's Asset Management Plan. Highlights of the presentation included:

- the purpose of the Asset Management Plan (AMP), being to maintain assets in a state of good repair;
- the implications of reducing Asset Management contributions;

- the \$1.2 billion in historical costs identified in the Town's 2023 financial statement;
- the financial impact of the Town assuming new subdivisions;
- the Town's annual infrastructure funding gap of \$10.8 million, which accounts for annual gap in funding between what the Town budgets and what is required to maintain assets in a state of good repair;
- the impact of budgetary decisions pertaining to the AMP demonstrated by an asset management budget simulator;
- future projects funded through the AMP;
- the infrastructure funding gaps identified by other municipalities such as the City of Toronto;
- the financial impact of proposed Council amendments on the Town's proposed 2025 to 2027 Budget;
- legislated requirements for an AMP, including new requirements identified under O. Reg. 588/17 effective July 1, 2025; and,
- the benefits of long-term planning through the AMP.

A question and answer period ensued between Members of Council and F. Wong regarding:

- clarification regarding the new AMP requirements identified under O. Reg. 588/17;
- the Town's infrastructure funding gap compared to the infrastructure funding gap identified by other municipalities;
- the implications of deferring the maintenance of assets;
- the Town's total annual debt repayment capacity;
- the balance of the Town's Asset Management Reserves;
- the Town's strategy for allocating Asset Management Reserve funds;
- whether new legislated requirements identified under O. Reg. 588/17 will impact forecasting for existing asset management projects;
- clarification regarding the estimated 2025 year-end balance of the Asset Management Reserve;

- the practice of some municipalities to identify their infrastructure levy separate from the property tax increase;
- confirmation that the proposed 4.5% levy increase includes both operating and infrastructure requirements;
- criteria for assessing the condition of Town assets to determine required maintenance and associated costs;
- efficiencies and additional pressures identified by Town staff in the draft 2025 budget; and,
- anticipate growth in the Town's Asset Management shortfall due to pending development and assumption of additional assets including new facilities such as the Whitby Sports Complex.

5.1 FS 48-24, Financial Services Department Report

Re: Reporting Requirement Per Ontario Regulation 284/09 – 2025 Budget

Resolution # 220-24

Moved by Councillor Leahy

Seconded by Councillor Shahid

1. That Report FS 48-24 be received;
2. That the full accrual accounting amounts identified in Report FS 48-24 be approved and included as budget figures in the December 31, 2025 audited financial statements; and,
3. That the Treasurer be authorized to make the required amendments to the budget figures in the Town's audited financial statements for any technical adjustments or amendments to the Town's 2025 budget adopted by Council.

Carried

6. Council Amendments to the 2025 to 2027 Strong Mayor's Budget

For more information on the 2025 Budget, please visit connectwhitby.ca/budget

6.1 Reduce Proposed 2025 Budget Asset Management Contributions by \$0.545 million

Discussion ensued between Members of Council regarding:

- concerns regarding deferring Asset Management contributions to future years and the deterioration of the Town's infrastructure;
- a desire to minimize the burden of the 2025 budget increase on taxpayers; and,
- the impact of reducing the proposed 2025 Asset Management contributions by \$0.545 million.

Moved by Councillor Shahid

Seconded by Councillor Cardwell

Whereas the Town's Asset Management Plan currently outlines a shortfall of \$10.8 million of annual funding to repair and replace aging municipal infrastructure;

Whereas the Proposed 2025 to 2027 Budget currently includes additional funding for Asset Management in the amounts of \$1.45 million in 2025, \$1.85 million in 2026, and \$2.6 million in 2027;

Whereas Council has heard from residents that a \$99 property tax increase in 2025 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill, for an average Whitby homeowner, related to the Proposed Budget is unaffordable;

Now therefore, be it resolved:

1. That the Proposed 2025 Budget be amended to remove \$0.545 million in the proposed addition for Asset Management (from \$1.45 million to \$0.905 million in 2025) to reduce the 2025 budget impact to an average Whitby homeowner from \$99 to \$89 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill; and
2. That if the Town has incremental 2025 assessment growth following the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation's return of the assessment roll, the incremental revenues be allocated towards the Town's 2025 Asset Management program which will maintain the \$89 impact for an average Whitby homeowner.

Motion lost later in the meeting (see following motions)

Moved by Councillor Leahy

Seconded by Councillor Yamada

That Items 1 and 2 of the main motion be amended to read as follows:

1. That the Proposed 2025 Budget be amended to remove \$0.95 million in the proposed addition for Asset Management (from \$1.45 million to \$0.5 million in 2025) to reduce the 2025 budget impact to an average Whitby homeowner from \$99 to \$83 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill; and
2. That if the Town has incremental 2025 assessment growth following the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation's return of the assessment roll, the incremental revenues be allocated towards the Town's 2025 Asset Management program which will maintain the \$83 impact for an average Whitby homeowner.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy		X	
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy	X		
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist		X	
Councillor Mulcahy		X	
Councillor Shahid	X		
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	4	5	0

Motion Lost (4 to 5)

Moved by Councillor Leahy
 Seconded by Councillor Yamada

That Items 1 and 2 of the main motion be amended to read as follows:

1. That the Proposed 2025 Budget be amended to remove \$0.7 million in the proposed addition for Asset Management (from \$1.45 million to \$0.75 million in 2025) to reduce the 2025 budget impact

to an average Whitby homeowner from \$99 to \$87 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill; and

2. That if the Town has incremental 2025 assessment growth following the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation's return of the assessment roll, the incremental revenues be allocated towards the Town's 2025 Asset Management program which will maintain the \$87 impact for an average Whitby homeowner.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy		X	
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy	X		
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist		X	
Councillor Mulcahy		X	
Councillor Shahid	X		
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	4	5	0

Motion Lost (4 to 5)

The main motion was then lost on a recorded vote as follows:

Moved by Councillor Shahid

Seconded by Councillor Cardwell

Whereas the Town's Asset Management Plan currently outlines a shortfall of \$10.8 million of annual funding to repair and replace aging municipal infrastructure;

Whereas the Proposed 2025 to 2027 Budget currently includes additional funding for Asset Management in the amounts of \$1.45 million in 2025, \$1.85 million in 2026, and \$2.6 million in 2027;

Whereas Council has heard from residents that a \$99 property tax increase in 2025 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill, for an average Whitby homeowner, related to the Proposed Budget is unaffordable;

Now therefore, be it resolved:

1. That the Proposed 2025 Budget be amended to remove \$0.545 million in the proposed addition for Asset Management (from \$1.45 million to \$0.905 million in 2025) to reduce the 2025 budget impact to an average Whitby homeowner from \$99 to \$89 on the Town's portion of the property tax bill; and
2. That if the Town has incremental 2025 assessment growth following the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation's return of the assessment roll, the incremental revenues be allocated towards the Town's 2025 Asset Management program which will maintain the \$89 impact for an average Whitby homeowner.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy		X	
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy	X		
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist		X	
Councillor Mulcahy		X	
Councillor Shahid	X		
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	4	5	0

Motion Lost (4 to 5)

6.2 Council Expense Budgets for Regional Councillors and Mayor

Discussion ensued between Members of Council regarding removing \$22,500 from the Town of Whitby's business expense budgets for Regional Councillors, including the Mayor.

A discussion ensued between Members of Council regarding:

- allocating a portion of the business expense budgets by Regional Councillors toward traditional methods of communication and public engagement efforts, rather than utilizing social media channels;
- the financial impact of reducing the business expense budgets for Regional Councillors on the Town's proposed budget;
- expensing conferences and seminars related to Regional business under the Regional Council Expense Policy;
- historic spending under the Town's Council Expense Policy; and,
- whether the Town's Council Expense Policy permits Councillors to expense communication materials such as event flyers.

Moved by Councillor Mulcahy

Seconded by Councillor Shahid

Whereas the Town of Whitby's business expense budget is \$13,695 per Councillor per year for Councillors and \$17,890 per year for the Mayor in the Proposed Budget for 2025;

Now therefore, be it resolved:

1. That \$22,500 be removed from the Town of Whitby's business expense budgets for the five Regional Councillors (including the Mayor) as follows:
 - a. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2025 Budget;
 - b. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2026 Budget; and,
 - c. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2027 Budget.

Carried later in the meeting (see following motions)

Moved by Councillor Yamada

Seconded by Councillor Leahy

That Item 1 of the main motion be amended to read as follows:

1. That \$7,500 be removed from the Town of Whitby's business expense budgets for the five Regional Councillors (including the Mayor) as follows:
 - a. Remove \$2,500 (or \$500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2025 Budget;
 - b. Remove \$2,500 (or \$500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2026 Budget; and,
 - c. Remove \$2,500 (or \$500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2027 Budget.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy		X	
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy		X	
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist		X	
Councillor Mulcahy	X		
Councillor Shahid		X	
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	3	6	0

Motion Lost (3 to 6)

Note: Councillor Cardwell abstained from voting on the amendment to Item 6.2, Council Expense Budgets for Regional Councillors and Mayor, and thus his vote was deemed to be a negative vote in accordance with the Municipal Act, 2001.

The main motion was then carried on a recorded vote as follows:

Resolution # 221-24

Moved by Councillor Mulcahy

Seconded by Councillor Shahid

Whereas the Town of Whitby's business expense budget is \$13,695 per Councillor per year for Councillors and \$17,890 per year for the Mayor in the Proposed Budget for 2025;

Now therefore, be it resolved:

1. That \$22,500 be removed from the Town of Whitby's business expense budgets for the five Regional Councillors (including the Mayor) as follows:
 1. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2025 Budget;
 2. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2026 Budget; and,
 3. Remove \$7,500 (or \$1,500 per Regional Councillor) from the Proposed 2027 Budget.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy	X		
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy		X	
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist	X		
Councillor Mulcahy	X		
Councillor Shahid	X		
Councillor Yamada		X	
Results	5	4	0

Carried (5 to 4)

Note: Councillor Cardwell abstained from voting on the main motion for Item 6.2, Council Expense Budgets for Regional Councillors and Mayor, and thus his vote was deemed to be a negative vote in accordance with the Municipal Act, 2001.

6.3 Gateway Maintenance Program

Note: This motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

6.4 Reduce Proposed 2025 Budget Asset Management Contributions by \$0.95 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.1, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

6.5 Reduce Proposed 2025 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$0.7 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.1, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

6.6 Reduce Proposed 2025 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$0.45 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.1, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

6.7 Proposed 2025 Budget - Remove Phase-out of Elexicon Dividend Revenue

Discussion ensued between Members of Council regarding the impact of removing the phase-out of Elexicon dividend revenue on affordability for residents by reducing the property tax increase.

A question and answer period ensued between Members of Council and Staff regarding:

- the historic decision to phase-out the Town's reliance on Elexicon dividend revenue to support the operating budget;
- the impact of removing the phase-out of Elexicon dividend revenue on the proposed budget;

- the process for calculating budget reductions required to achieve a 3.99% tax rate increase, should Council approve any additional proposed 2025 Budget amendments; and,
- ensuring the sustainability of efficiencies identified in the 2025 Budget for future budgets.

Moved by Councillor Leahy

Seconded by Councillor Yamada

That the phase-out of the Elexicon Dividend Revenue be removed from the Proposed 2025 Budget and revenue budget be increased by \$0.22 million.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy		X	
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell		X	
Councillor Leahy	X		
Councillor Lee		X	
Councillor Lundquist		X	
Councillor Mulcahy		X	
Councillor Shahid		X	
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	3	6	0

Motion Lost (3 to 6)

6.8 Proposed 2025 Budget - 3.99% Overall

Discussion ensued between Members of Council regarding:

- the impact of increased property taxes on affordability for residents;
- appreciation for the feedback of residents regarding the budget;

- identifying efficiencies in future budgets to reduce the proposed increase to the Town's portion of the property tax bill;
- funding for future projects, including construction and staffing of the new Whitby Sports Complex;
- the one time impact of grant funding to support housing development;
- the impact of the proposed 3.99% increase on the average residential property owner;
- budget increases due to inflationary pressures;
- the number of 2025 Budget community engagement sessions and public communication regarding the budget;
- reevaluating the sources of municipal funding to meet demands of inflation and growth; and,
- the benefits of a multi-year budget.

Resolution # 222-24

Moved by Councillor Leahy

Seconded by Councillor Yamada

1. That the Proposed 2025, 2026 and 2027 Budgets be amended to reflect an overall budget shortfall or levy increase of 3.99%; and,
2. That Staff be authorized to adjust the budget expenditures and revenues to reflect a 3.99% net levy increase.

	For	Against	Conflict
Mayor Roy	X		
Councillor Bozinovski	X		
Councillor Cardwell	X		
Councillor Leahy	X		
Councillor Lee	X		
Councillor Lundquist	X		

Councillor Mulcahy	X		
Councillor Shahid	X		
Councillor Yamada	X		
Results	9	0	0

Carried (9 to 0)

- 6.9 Reduce Proposed 2026 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$1.35 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.10 Reduce Proposed 2026 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$1.1 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.11 Reduce Proposed 2026 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$0.85 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.12 Proposed 2026 Budget - Remove Phase-out of Elexicon Dividend Revenue

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.13 Proposed 2026 Budget - 3.99% Overall

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.14 Reduce Proposed 2027 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$2.1 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.15 Reduce Proposed 2027 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$1.85 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.16 Reduce Proposed 2027 Budget Asset Management Contribution by \$1.6 million

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.17 Proposed 2027 Budget - Remove Phase-out of Elexicon Dividend Revenue

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

- 6.18 Proposed 2027 Budget - 3.99% Overall

Note: Following Council's consideration of Item 6.8, this motion was withdrawn by the Mover.

7. Confirmatory By-law

Resolution # 223-24

Moved by Councillor Leahy

Seconded by Councillor Cardwell

That leave be granted to introduce a by-law and to dispense with the reading of the by-law by the Clerk to confirm the proceedings of the Council of the Town of Whitby at its special meeting held on November 28, 2024 and the same be considered read and passed and that the Mayor and the Clerk sign the same and the Seal of the Corporation be thereto affixed.

Carried

8. Adjournment

Motion to Adjourn

Moved by Councillor Lee

Seconded by Councillor Shahid

That the meeting adjourn.

Carried

The meeting adjourned at 9:33 p.m.

Christopher Harris, Town Clerk

Elizabeth Roy, Mayor